CASE STUDIES IN PLAGIARISM

Study #5

“Zakir Naik Receives Award”

Authored by Ahmed Shabaan and Shafaat Shahbandari

Plagiarized by Yusuf Estes

Detailed Documentation

Prepared by:

M. Richardson

©2013 All rights reserved
CASE STUDIES IN PLAGIARISM (#5)

Side-by-Side Comparison of Two Recent Articles on Dr. Zakir Naik’s “Islamic Personality” Award

---

**IN BLACK:**

Islamic personality award to be given to Zakir Naik

Author: Ahmed Shaaban

July 26, 2013

Dubai: The Dubai International Holy Quran Award (DIHQA) has announced Dr. Zakir Naik of India as the Islamic Personality of the Year for 2013, replacing Shaikh Ahmad Al Tayyeb, Grand Imam of Al Azhar, who was earlier named by DIHQA.

In an emergency press conference called by DIHQA organising committee at the Dubai Chamber of Commerce, venue of DIHQA programs the decision was announced to the media.

The Dubai International Holy Quran Award Committee changed the Award for Islamic Personality of the Year, for the first time ever in the award’s 17-year history.

Earlier, the award had announced Grand Imam of Al Azhar Dr Sheikh Ahmed Al Tayyeb as Islamic Personality of the year.

Ibrahim Bu Melha, Chairman of the organising committee of the award, said due to the unstable situations and political unrest in Egypt, the award organising committee has decided to postpone honouring Dr Al Tayyeb to later years in response to his request.

"Instead, the award has chosen the popular Indian scholar Dr Zakir Naik as the Islamic Personality of the Year in appreciation to his tireless effort in the service of Islam and Quran."

Dr Zakir, who is also a surgeon, is the founder and president of the Islamic Research Foundation. He has written two books on Islam and comparative religion. He is regarded as an exponent of the Salafi ideology.

---

**IN RED:**

Zakir Naik named Islamic Personality of the Year

Author: Shafaat Shahbandari

July 28, 2013

Dubai: The Dubai International Holy Quran Award (DIHQA) has named Dr. Zakir Naik of India as the Islamic Personality of the Year for 2013, replacing Shaikh Ahmad Al Tayyeb, Grand Imam of Al Azhar, who was earlier named by DIHQA.

The Dubai International Holy Quran Award, on Friday night changed the Islamic Personality of the Year, for the first time ever in the award’s 17-year history.

Earlier, the award had announced Grand Imam of Al Azhar Dr Sheikh Ahmed Al Tayyeb as Islamic Personality of the year.

Ibrahim Bu Melha, Chairman of the organising committee of the award, said due to the unstable situations and political unrest in Egypt, the award organising committee has decided to postpone honouring Dr Al Tayyeb to later years in response to his request.

"Instead, the award has chosen the popular Indian scholar Dr Zakir Naik as the Islamic Personality of the Year in appreciation to his tireless effort in the service of Islam and Quran."

Dr Zakir, who is also a surgeon, is the founder and president of the Islamic Research Foundation. He has written two books on Islam and comparative religion. He is regarded as an exponent of the Salafi ideology.

In an interview with Khaleej Times last year, Dr Naik said...
In an interview with Khaleej Times last year, Dr Naik said all of his children - one son, 18, and two daughters, 16 and 14, have memorised the Holy Quran in full, have black belts, speak Arabic fluently, and study Islamic sciences. They are combining religious and world knowledge together.

“My son is even better than me; I only give lectures in English and Urdu, but he additionally speaks Arabic and sign language fluently. He also fully memorised the Quran unlike me. Also, my wife is giving Dawa in English and Urdu. Thanks to Allah, all my family members are calling from Islam.”

Ebrahim Bumilha, is the Chairman for DIH Quran Award's organising committee.

Bumilha said that the decision was taken due to Shaikh Al Tayyeb's inability to travel as a result of Egypt's worsening security situation.

"Shaikh Al Tayyeb is unable to travel due to the situation in Egypt, which is very sensitive. Compelled by the situation the organising committee has made a decision to name Dr. Zakir Naik, renowned Islamic scholar and preacher as the Islamic Personality for the 17th session," announced Bumilha.

Mumbai-based Dr. Naik is a medical doctor by training but has made name world over as dynamic Islamic Orator on Islam and Comparative religion.

Dr. Naik has held hundreds of lectures and debates world over, several of them in Dubai, and is popular for critical analysis and scientific explanations of religious subjects.

The 48 year old scholar, who is a disciple of late South African Islamic scholar Ahmad Deedat, has also authored several best-selling Islamic books.

**SOURCES (Accessed July 29, 2013):**

Mr. Yusuf Estes’ article: [http://islamnewsroom.com/news-we-need/2118](http://islamnewsroom.com/news-we-need/2118)


INITIAL ASSESSMENT AND FOLLOW-UP

The initial assumption made in this case was that it seemed Mr. Yusuf Estes copied the content from the works of Mr. Ahmed Shaaban and Mr. Shafaat Shahbandari, cutting and pasting them together as indicated by the red and black color in the texts quoted above. This assumption was made for the following reasons:

1) Mr. Ahmed Shaaban’s article (dated July 26, 2013) was published two days before that of Mr. Yusuf Estes (dated July 28, 2013).

2) The repetition of information in Mr. Yusuf Estes’ article indicates a copy and paste job from two different sources.

3) Mr. Yusuf Estes’ history of plagiarism. (See our previous case studies.)

07-26-2013: Information was collected.

10-31-2013: An email was sent to Mr. Ahmed Shaaban requesting an official statement. No contact information for Mr. Shahbandari could be located.

10-31-2013: Mr. Shaaban responds by email confirming the article to be his and that the other article attributed to Mr. Yusuf Estes was actually taken from his work.

11-01-2013: Case study closed: Obviously another case of Mr. Yusuf Estes’ plagiarism.

12-19-2013: Case study published for the benefit of those interested in plagiarism studies in general, and to warn against the specific violations of academic integrity perpetrated by Yusuf Estes as well. A series of case studies of the plagiarism of Yusuf Estes is made available at www.YusufEstesQuran.com, as well as other reports of incidents of academic dishonesty.
Dr. Zakir Naik #1Choice

UAE Qur'an Foundation

Dubai: The Dubai International Holy Qur'an Award (DIHQA) has announced Dr. Zakir Naik of India as the Islamic Personality of the Year for 2013, replacing Shaikh Ahmad Al Tayyeb, Grand Imam of Al Azhar, who was earlier named by DIHQA.

In an emergency press conference called by DIHQA organising committee at the Dubai Chamber of Commerce, venue of DIHQA programs the decision was announced to the media.

The Dubai International Holy Qur'an Award Committee changed the
Dubai: The Dubai International Holy Quran Award (DIHQA) has announced Dr. Zakir Naik of India as the Islamic Personality of the Year for 2013, replacing Shaikh Ahmad Al Tayyeb, Grand Imam of Al Azhar, who was earlier named by DIHQA.

In an emergency press conference called by DIHQA organising committee at the Dubai Chamber of Commerce, venue of DIHQA programs the decision was announced to the media.

The Dubai International Holy Quran Award Committee changed the Award for Islamic Personality of the Year, for the first time ever in the award’s 17-year history.

Earlier, the award had announced Grand Imam of Al Azhar Dr Sheikh Ahmed Al Tayyeb as Islamic Personality of the year.

Ibrahim Bu Melha, Chairman of the organising committee of the award, said due to the unstable situations and political unrest in Egypt, the award organising committee has decided to postpone honouring Dr Al Tayyeb to later years in response to his request.

"Instead, the award has chosen the popular Indian scholar Dr Zakir Naik as the Islamic Personality of the Year in appreciation to his tireless effort in the service of Islam and Quran."

Dr Zakir, who is also a surgeon, is the founder and president of the Islamic Research Foundation. He has written two books on Islam and comparative religion. He is regarded as an exponent of the Salafi ideology.

In an interview with Khaleej Times last year, Dr Naik said all of his children - one son, 18, and two daughters, 16 and 14, have memorised the Holy Quran in full, have black belts, speak Arabic fluently, and
Islamic personality award to be given to Zakir Naik

Ahmed Shaaban / 26 July 2013

The Dubai International Holy Quran Award, on Friday night changed the Islamic Personality of the Year, for the first time ever in the award’s 17-year history.

Earlier, the award had announced Grand Imam of Al Azhar Dr Sheikh Ahmed Al Tayyeb as Islamic Personality of the year.

Ibrahim Bu Melha, Chairman of the organising committee of the award, said due to the unstable
The Dubai International Holy Quran Award, on Friday night changed the Islamic Personality of the Year, for the first time ever in the award’s 17-year history.

Earlier, the award had announced Grand Imam of Al Azhar Dr Sheikh Ahmed Al Tayyeb as Islamic Personality of the year.

Ibrahim Bu Melha, Chairman of the organising committee of the award, said due to the unstable situations and political unrest in Egypt, the award organising committee has decided to postpone honouring Dr Al Tayyeb to later years in response to his request.

"Instead, the award has chosen the popular Indian scholar Dr Zakir Naik as the Islamic Personality of the Year in appreciation to his tireless effort in the service of Islam and Quran."

Dr Zakir, who is also a surgeon, is the founder and president of the Islamic Research Foundation. He has written two books on Islam and comparative religion. He is regarded as an exponent of the Salafi ideology.

In an interview with Khaleej Times last year, Dr Naik said all of his children - one son, 18, and two daughters, 16 and 14, have memorised the Holy Quran in full, have black belts, speak Arabic fluently, and study Islamic sciences. They are combining religious and world knowledge together.

“My son is even better than me; I only give lectures in English and Urdu, but he additionally speaks Arabic and sign language fluently. He also fully memorised the Quran unlike me. Also, my wife is giving Dawa in English and Urdu. Thanks to Allah, all my family members are calling from Islam.”

ahmedshaaban@khaleejtimes.com
Dubai: The Dubai International Holy Quran Award (DIHQA) has named Dr. Zakir Naik of India as the Islamic Personality of the Year for 2013, replacing Shaikh Ahmad Al Tayyeb, Grand Imam of Al Azhar, who was earlier named by DIHQA.

The decision was announced by Ebrahim Bumilha, Chairman of DIHQA's organising committee, on Monday.

Bumilha said that the decision was taken due to Shaikh Al Tayyeb's inability to travel because of the worsening security situation in Egypt.

"Shaikh Al Tayyeb is unable to travel due to the situation in Egypt, which is very sensitive. Compelled by the situation the organising committee has made a decision to name Dr. Zakir Naik, renowned Islamic scholar and preacher as the Islamic Personality for the 17th session," Bumilha said.

Mumbai-based Dr. Naik is a medical doctor but has made a name as a dynamic orator on Islam and Comparative religion.

Dr. Naik has held hundreds of lectures and debates around the world, several of them in Dubai, and is popular for critical analysis and scientific explanations of religious subjects.

The 48-year-old scholar, who is a disciple of the late South African Islamic scholar Ahmad Deedat, has also authored several best-selling Islamic books.